



WEST VIRGINIA BROADBAND ENHANCEMENT COUNCIL

APPROVED MINUTES/February 13, 2025

Meeting Title	WV Broadband Enhancement Council	Time	10:00 a.m.
Chairman	William D. 'Bill' Bissett, Chair	Location	Online Meeting
https://docs.google.com/forms/register Call information available upon registration.		Register for public comment. Hold comments until public comment portion of agenda.	P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent

	Member	Representing		Council Member	Representing
P	William D. (Bill) Bissett Chairman	Large Scale Broadband		P	The Honorable Scott Edwards Rural Business User, Congressional District 1
P	Michael J. Holstine Secretary-Treasurer	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 3 / (Now Rural Residential User District 1)		—	Michael R. Graney WVDED Acting Secretary
P	Roger Calhoun	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 3 /Now Urban Residential User (1 of 2)		P	Jeff Proctor Vice Chairman Representing Secretary Graney
—	Michele Blatt Superintendent	WV Dept. of Education		—	Robert Cole Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 1/(Now 2)
—	Tim Conzett, WVDE Office of Data Management	Representing Michele Blatt		P	Honorable Ron Pearson Rural Residential User Cong. Dist. 2/ Now Urban Residential User (2 of 2)
—	Heather D. Abbott Chief Technology Officer	WV Office of Technology		—	The Honorable Robert L. Morris, Jr. WV Senate (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
P	James Dixon Jeff Whitman	Representing Heather Abbott		—	The Honorable Jarred Cannon WV House (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
—	Matt Turner Vice Chancellor	WV Higher Education Policy Commission HEPC		—	WV Senate (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
P	Steve White Director, WVNET	Representing Matt Turner		—	WV House (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
—	Representative	Agency		Representative	Agency
P	Kelly Workman, Jamie Hoffmann	WVDED - Office of Broadband		P	Steffani Sanders Chris Campbell Andrew Joseph Tilson Technology Management
P	Jim Kelsh, Peter Markham	Bowles Rice Legal Counsel			

VACANCIES:

- Urban Business User (2 Members, Any District) and Rural Business User, District 2

Agenda Item	Details/Minutes
1. Call to Order; Roll Call; Opening Remarks	Welcome New Senate Ex-Officio Member, The Honorable Robert L. Morris, Jr.! We are very pleased he will remain involved with Broadband Council. If you see him, please congratulate him.
2. Approval of December 2024 Meeting,	Minutes: Motion to approve, Judge Ron Pearson - first, Roger Calhoun -

Minutes, and Financial Statement	second. Minutes to be filed. Financial statement by Sabrina Stollings As of Dec. 1, beginning balance of \$806,941.31 Three invoices paid: Tilson \$6,075.00 Bowles Rice \$1,798.00 Commerce Communication \$48.15 Total December expenses \$7,921.15 Ending balance \$799,020.16 As of Jan. 1 beginning balance of \$799,020.16 4 Invoices paid and a payroll allocation Tilson \$5,287.50 3 Bowles Rice Invoices 1st \$320.50 2nd \$1,674.00 3rd \$652.50 Payroll allocation \$1,278.81 Total January expenses \$9,213.31 Jan. 31 Ending balance \$789,806.85 Report to be filed for audit.
3. Public Service Commission of West Virginia Pole Attachment Task Force CASE NO. 24-0703-T-E-CTV-GI Designation of Council representative(s). https://www.psc.state.wv.us/WebDocket/default.htm	Peter Markham, Bowles Rice On August 23, 2024, in consultation with the Office of Broadband, the Commission created a task force to consider and recommend incorporating by General Order and/or rule modification to the Commission's Rules for the Government of Pole Attachments (Pole Attachment Rules), 150 C.S.R. 38. Final Report Issued January 31, 2025 1st - Recommends the establishment of a Rapid Response Team within the PSC. If an ISP has an issue with attaching to a pole, they can initiate mediation with the Rapid Response Team, to hopefully get on the pole quickly by resolving the dispute. We wanted the Office of Broadband to be included in these mediations as needed, representing the granting agency. The commission will consider that moving forward. 2nd - Requiring utility pole owners to share their pole inspection reports to any potential attachers. Apparently not all utilities gather the same information, so we suggested that the PSC adopt a uniform data pole information standard. The Office of Broadband is working to build a database for this type of information. 3rd - Require Utility companies to report annually their compliance with applicable laws and regulations. 4th - The main pole owner utilities compiled a list of engineers to perform changes for attachments. The final report recommends that these changes go into effect immediately. The Council and Office have also requested to continue a working group to ensure the rules are being implemented and additional issues are handled moving forward. They agreed.

4. Verizon to Acquire Frontier CASE NO 24-0853-T-PC; Council consideration of Petition to Intervene	Jim Kelsh, Bowles Rice Verizon and Frontier jointly filed a petition with the WV Public Service Commission for approval of the transfer of Frontier to Verizon on October 31, 2024. The Commission recommends a decision by May 29, 2025. • Update on Council's Petition to Intervene The commissioners of the PSC are keeping this case, will not be referred to the Division of Administrative Law of Judges. The joint applicants are scheduled to file testimony by March 3rd. For the interveners, which includes the BEC, testimony is due by April 3rd. Rebuttal testimony by May 15th, Public comment Hearing June 11, Evidentiary Hearing at the PSC June 12th and 13th. In the process of preparing Discovery, mostly to Verizon regarding its pole attachment practices, hoping to have that in by the end of week, then have 20 days to respond to that. We intend to file testimony by April 3rd.
5. ARPA Project Update by Jamie Hoffman	ARPA Progress Report Active Grant Overview. Projects are moving forward. 24 in Permitting and Design, 3 in Close Out, 1 Complete. The majority are delayed in Permitting and design due to the pole attachment issues, which is why the task force is so important. ARPA Dashboard www.wvbroadband.maps.arcgis.com Search by Funding, Availability, and Statewide Statistics Maps. Also County Maps, current projects, even by Provider, who is served and who is underserved.
8. IJJA NTIA: Broadband Equity, Access and Deployment (BEAD) by Andrew Joseph	B.E.A.D Progress Report Key Milestones Five year Action Plan, approved 9/2023, Initial Proposal Vol. 1, approved 01/2024, Initial Proposal Vol. 2 Approved 4/2024, State Challenge Process approved 8/2024, Project Selection in process that is projected to be complete Q1 2025, then the final proposal due to NTIA by 4/16/2025 and Project implementation occurs from 2025-2029. What is included in the Final Proposal? Results of Deployment Project Selection, Completed and Planned Subgrantee Selection Process and the Status of Compliance with Requirements. Public Comment period should occur Mid-March
9. Public Comment	Sign-In for Public Comment, no public comments.
10. Next Meeting / Adjournment	Google Meet: March 13, 2025



WEST VIRGINIA BROADBAND ENHANCEMENT COUNCIL

APPROVED MINUTES / March 13, 2025

Meeting Title	WV Broadband Enhancement Council		Time	10:00 a.m.	
Chairman	William D. 'Bill' Bissett, Chair		Location	Online Meeting	
https://docs.google.com/forms/register Call information available upon registration.		Register for public comment. Hold comments until public comment portion of agenda.		P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent	
	Member	Representing		Council Member	Representing
X	William D. (Bill) Bissett Chairman	Large Scale Broadband	X	The Honorable Scott Edwards	Rural Business User, Congressional District 1
X	Michael J. Holstine Secretary-Treasurer	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 3 / (Now Rural Residential User District 1)	—	Michael R. Graney	WVDED Acting Secretary
X	Roger Calhoun	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 3 / Now Urban Residential User (1 of 2)	X	Jeff Proctor	Vice Chairman Representing Secretary Graney
—	Michele Blatt Superintendent	WV Dept. of Education	—	Robert Cole	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 1/(Now 2)
X	Tim Conzett, WVDE Office of Data Management	Representing Michele Blatt	—	Honorable Ron Pearson	Rural Residential User Cong. Dist. 2/ Now Urban Residential User (2 of 2)
—	Heather D. Abbott Chief Technology Officer	WV Office of Technology	—	The Honorable Robert L. Morris, Jr.	WV Senate (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	James Dixon Jeff Whitman	Representing Heather Abbott	—	The Honorable Jarred Cannon	WV House (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
—	Matt Turner Vice Chancellor	WV Higher Education Policy Commission HEPC	—		WV Senate (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	Steve White Director, WVNET	Representing Matt Turner	—		WV House (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
—	Representative	Agency		Representative	Agency
X	Kelly Workman, Jamie Hoffmann Jim Kelsh, Peter Markham	WVDED - Office of Broadband Bowles Rice Legal Counsel	X	Steffani Sanders Chris Campbell Andrew Joseph	Tilson Technology Management
COUNCIL VACANCIES: Urban Business User (2 Members, Any District) and Rural Business User, District 2					
Agenda Item			Details/Minutes		
1. Call to Order; Roll Call; Opening Remarks			Quorum met		

2. Approval of February 2025 Meeting, Minutes, and Financial Statement	February 2025 Minutes Motion to approve minutes by Jeff Proctor, Michael Holstine seconded. February minutes to be filed. February 2025 Financial Report by Sabrina Stollings Beginning balance: \$789,806.85 Total February Expenses: \$20,109.12 Ending February Balance: \$769,697.73 Jeff Proctor made a motion to approve, Mike Holstine seconded. All in favor. The February 2025 Financial Report will be filed.
3. Public Service Commission of West Virginia (Commission) Pole Attachment Task Force CASE NO. 24-0703-T-E-CTV-GI Designation of Council representative(s). https://www.psc.state.wv.us/WebDocket/default.htm	Jim Kelsh, Bowles Rice On August 23, 2024, the WVPSC created a task force to consider and recommend incorporating by General Order and/or rule modification to the Commission's Rules for the Government of Pole Attachments (Pole Attachment Rules), 150 C.S.R. 38. 1.) All parties agreed upon the pole owners joint list of outside contractors and engineers, the PSC approved that list which pole owners are required to update on a quarterly basis. 2.) Rapid Response Teams, designated people at PSC, ready to address in proper manner complaints by pole attachers regarding pole owners actions. The Rapid Response Team can reach out to the Office of Broadband on a case by case basis. 3.) Pole inspection reporting, the Council asked the Commission to require more extensive information on each pole, when the pole was installed, what attachers are on it, pole height, and other details. This was deferred to continued proceedings by the Task Force. 4.) Pole Attachment Annual Report requirement, deferred to continued proceedings by the Task Force. The Commission asked parties to file a procedural proposal by March 8 and the comments be filed by March 27th, the PSC Staff has submitted a proposal hoping to hear the outcome soon.
4. Verizon to Acquire Frontier CASE NO 24-0853-T-PC; Council consideration of Petition to Intervene	Jim Kelsh, Bowles Rice Verizon and Frontier jointly filed a petition with the WV Public Service Commission for approval of the transfer of Frontier to Verizon on October 31, 2024. The Commission recommends a decision by May 29, 2025. • Procedural Schedule issued in this case Verizon and Frontier pre-filed written direct testimony on March 3. Other parties must submit testimony by April 3, and this includes the Council. • Rebuttal testimony due May 15th. The evidentiary hearing is scheduled June 12 & 13th at the PSC headquarters. • It is Verizon's intent to continue Frontier's broadband efforts. • In regard to pole issues, they plan to quickly resolve disputes and develop solutions. • Frontier, due to its financial position, would not be able to take on additional financial debt for further broadband expansion, whereas Verizon is capable of funding further broadband expansion. • We are fairly certain that the Commission will approve the transfer of Frontier to Verizon. real question is what terms

	will be included in a joint stipulation to make Verizon accountable moving forward. ➤ Motion presented to give Chairman Bissett the Council's authority to approve the testimony for filing and to enter into a settlement agreement. Motion by Mike Holstine, Jeff Proctor seconded. All in favor. Motion carries.
5. ARPA Project Update	Progress Report by Jamie Hoffmann 39,617 Targeted Locations within 41 Counties. 4 Projects have completed, Preconstruction 6, Permitting and Design 17, Construction 15. Anticipating 26 projects to be completed by the end of 2025 and 16 by end of 2026. WV Pole Attachment Concerns: 1. Workforce Management/scheduling and completing make ready work. 2. High volume attachments requiring power make ready. 3. Miscommunication 4. Changes in pole owner attachment policy. 5. Disputes in pole betterment, so that the cost of replacing a pole is not placed solely upon the ISP. Jeff Hartley 4,060 of 39,617 hit so far. Overview of our ARPA rural Broadband Development per ISP and project.
8. IIJA NTIA: Broadband Equity, Access and Deployment (BEAD) Update	Progress Report by Kelly Workman WV broadband fiber deployment in 2019 compared to 2024, 240% increase. Also important, tracking speed and performance. Thanks to Ookla, speed tests give a voice to the consumer, as well as progression for our state. BEAD • \$1.2 Billion allocation to WV approved: April 18, 2024 • Challenge Process Final Results Approved: August 20, 2024 • 60 Day Full Application Phase August 26-October 24, 2024 • Planned Extension Phase: November 13-December 19, 2024 • December 2024 through January - March 2025 ◆ Application review, potential award determinations, data submission and validation, development of Final Proposal, NTIA Special Awards Conditions Meeting, Public Comment and Response • We expect to release the Final Proposal for public comment near the end of March and meet the April 18, 2025 deadline. Total BEAD Eligible Locations 114,178 Total WV Broadband Serviceable Locations 900,408 Final Proposal Next, then once NTIA approval is received, we will begin Implementation with a 4 year build out period. Changes to program: We are confident we can adjust or modify the proposal as needed. Some outcomes discussed could be very beneficial, such as expediting the permitting phase. If there is a pause, we hope it will be short. BEAD Workforce Many broadband industry positions pay a higher wage than many others in WV. These include a mix of manual,

	specialized, supervisory roles and many others. We are working with many educational institutions to make sure we can fill the need in the build out and continue maintenance of the infrastructure once built. Continuous Mapping of Broadband Infrastructure, the map always changing and must be constantly updated and accessible to all West Virginians.

Public Comment	Sign-In for Public Comment, no public comment.
Next Meeting / 10. Adjournment	Google Meet: April 17, 2025 (<i>WVDED Note-This date is incorrect. The next meeting date is April 10. 2025</i>).



WEST VIRGINIA BROADBAND ENHANCEMENT COUNCIL

Approved Minutes/April 10, 2025

Meeting Title		WV Broadband Enhancement Council		Time		10:00 a.m.	
Chairman		William D. Bill’ Bissett, Chair		Location		Online Meeting	
https://docs.google.com/forms/register Call information available upon registration.			Register for public comment. Hold comments until public comment portion of agenda.			P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent	
	Member	Representing			Council Member	Representing	
X	William D. (Bill) Bissett Chairman	Large Scale Broadband			–	The Honorable Scott Edwards	Rural Business User, Congressional District 1
X	Michael J. Holstine Secretary-Treasurer	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 3 / (Now Rural Residential User District 1)			–	Michael R. Graney	WVDED Acting Secretary
X	Roger Calhoun	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 3 /Now Urban Residential User (1 of 2)			X	Jeff Proctor	Vice Chairman Representing Secretary Graney
–	Michele Blatt Superintendent	WV Dept. of Education			–	Robert Cole	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 1/(Now 2)
X	Tim Conzett, WVDE Office of Data Mgt.	Representing Michele Blatt			X	Honorable Ron Pearson	Rural Residential User Cong. Dist. 2/ Urban Residential User (2 of2)
–	Heather D. Abbott Chief Technology Officer	WV Office of Technology			–	The Honorable Robert L. Morris, Jr.	WV Senate (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	James Dixon Jeff Whitman	Representing Heather Abbott			–	The Honorable Jarred Cannon	WV House (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
–	Matt Turner Vice Chancellor	WV Higher Education Policy Commission HEPC			–		WV Senate (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	Steve White Director, WVNET	Representing Matt Turner			–		WV House (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
COUNCIL VACANCIES: Urban Business User (2 Members, Any District) and Rural Business User, District 2							
X	Kelly Workman Jamie Hoffmann Jim Kelsh Peter Markham	WVDED - Office of Broadband Bowles Rice Legal Counsel			X	Steffani Sanders Chris Campbell Andrew Joseph	Tilson Technology Management
Agenda Item				Details/Minutes			
1. Call to Order; Roll Call; Opening Remarks							

2. Approval of March 2025 Meeting, Minutes, and Financial Statement	Minutes approved by Jeff Holstine, second by Jeff Proctor. Minutes approved unanimously and shall be filed. Financial Statement by Sabrina Stollings \$769,697.73 March beginning balance Expenses: \$ 281.25 Tilson Technologies \$4,634.50 Bowles Rice \$1,302.00 Bowles Rice \$1,994.75 Bowles Rice \$ 142.51 Payroll Allocation \$8,355.01 March Total Expenses \$761,342.72 March Ending Balance (Ookla payment has been delayed by processing issues and will be included in the next report.) Motion to approve Mike Holstine, Second by Jeff Proctor. Financial statement accepted.
3. Public Service Commission of West Virginia Pole Attachment Task Force CASE NO. 24-0703-T-E-CTV-GI www.psc.state.wv.us/WebDocket/default.htm	Peter Markham, Bowles Rice On August 23, 2024, the WVPSC created a task force to consider and recommend incorporating by General Order and/or rule modification to the Commission's Rules for the Government of Pole Attachments (Pole Attachment Rules), 150 C.S.R. 38. • Final Report Issued January 31, 2025 • Procedural Schedule Issued March 3, 2025 • May 7th deadline for parties to give testimony. • June 9th for rebuttal testimony. • June 9th and 10th Hearing. • The final schedule remains pending. • In its filing, the Council recommended that pole owners and providers, PSC Staff, and Office of Broadband be included in the advisory working group. We included models that are working for other states that we may be able to implement. Pole Attachment Working Group is the suggested name, which is also used in Pennsylvania. Additional information will be provided in April.
4. Verizon to Acquire Frontier CASE NO 24-0853-T-PC	Jim Kelsh, Bowles Rice Verizon and Frontier jointly filed a petition with the WVPSC for approval of the transfer of Frontier to Verizon on October 31, 2024. The Commission recommends a decision by May 29, 2025. • Update on Procedural Filings and Schedule • April 3, the Council filed testimony. • Rebuttal testimony is due May 15 • Evidentiary Hearing June 12th • Settlement discussions are expected. Verizon will take on current projects previously awarded to Frontier, and the Council also would push for Verizon to take on the BEAD program projects that are soon to be awarded. • Frontier also planned to include fiber to 150,000 homes by 2027, a \$200 million dollar investment. The Council notes that Verizon will be accountable for this investment. • Verizon's Forward program, packages that are offered as low as \$20 per month. • Verizon should report quarterly on their broadband expansion, as well as their success with their promotions.

8. IJA NTIA: Broadband Equity, Access and Deployment (BEAD) Update

Progress Report on West Virginia's \$1.2 Billion BEAD Allocation

Kelly Workman, WVDED Office of Broadband

For baseline data, Broadband is a Target Industry in WV. Broadband supports all other Economic Development throughout the State.

Governor Morrisey has requested a 90-day extension of the original April 18, 2025, deadline. The new deadline is roughly July 18, 2025. What will the State do in the extra time?

We have been reviewing what is in the purview of anticipated changes from NTIA to be more in alignment with upcoming changes, such as programmatic changes. These revisions can be administrative, however, items that are within the IJA statute may not be easily changed without action from Congress.

Possible **Administrative** program revisions may include:

1. Davis-Bacon, prevailing wage, the opportunity would be to relax administrative load.
2. Environmental Permitting, how quickly we can get projects to construction and would streamline this process.
3. Letter of Credit, reduction of amount, would be helpful.
4. Procurement requirements, streamline with less reporting.
5. Climate Resiliency Requirements, streamline with less reporting.
6. Eligible Entity, NTIA setting rates, NOFO items related to states imposing low-cost rates could be amended by NTIA.
7. 25% Non-refundable Match Requirement, Note: While part of IJA, NTIA has discretion to waive upon State or subgrantee request.

Possible considerations in IJA Statute:

1. Prohibition on BEAD funds for covered communications equipment or services. (Secure and Trusted Communications Networks Act of 2019)
2. Build America, Buy America (BABA) (The U.S. Department of Commerce has already issued a Limited Waiver)
3. Prohibition of Fiber Cable/Equipment from China
4. BEAD Program Speed and Latency/Maximum Allowable Network Outages Requirements
5. Conduit Access Points requirements (for underground fiber) Requirement to include access points at regular intervals for interconnection by unaffiliated entities.

West Virginia Seeks Clarity from NTIA Regarding Program Revisions

West Virginia's program has been approved in all steps, and all requirements have been met. West Virginia's plan expands broadband to all corners of West Virginia.

Any revisions by the federal agency should incorporate all work completed and approved to date. The State should not be required to repeat completed work. It would be less than beneficial to discount or leave out all of the work that has been done to date.

Along with our network of partners, the Office of Broadband has conducted numerous community outreach events, where there is so

	much skepticism, to be expected. We had assured the people of West Virginia that this time would be different. Hopefully, West Virginia's plan will align with the direction from the Federal Government and meet approval.
Public Comment	Sign-In for Public Comment. Derek B.: Do you know if providers will have to resubmit applications from the beginning? Kelly Workman: It would be counterproductive to repeat activities that have already been completed. The Office of Broadband wants to preserve the significant time and effort that has already been put forth and the results that have been achieved. No one is opposed to the work. We are willing to put in the hard work, we just need clarity from the federal agency.
Next Meeting / 10. Adjournment	Michael Hostine motion to adjourn, Tim Conzett seconded. Google Meet: May 8, 2025



WEST VIRGINIA BROADBAND ENHANCEMENT COUNCIL

APPROVED Minutes/May 8, 2025

Meeting Title	WV Broadband Enhancement Council	Time	10:00 a.m.
Chairman	William D. 'Bill' Bissett, Chair	Location	Online Meeting
https://docs.google.com/forms/register Call information available upon registration.		Register for public comment. Hold comments until public comment portion of agenda.	P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent

	Member	Representing		Council Member	Representing
X	William D. (Bill) Bissett Chairman	Large Scale Broadband	—	The Honorable Scott Edwards	Rural Business User, Congressional District 1
X	Michael J. Holstine Secretary-Treasurer	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 3 / (Now Rural Residential User District 1)	—	Michael R. Graney	WVDED Acting Secretary
—	Roger Calhoun	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 3 /Now Urban Residential User (1 of 2)	X	Jeff Proctor	Vice Chairman Representing Secretary Graney
—	Michele Blatt Superintendent	WV Dept. of Education	X	Robert Cole	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 1/(Now 2)
X	Tim Conzett, WVDE Office of Data Management	Representing Michele Blatt	X	Honorable Ron Pearson	Rural Residential User Cong. Dist. 2/ Now Urban Residential User (2 of 2)
—	Heather D. Abbott Chief Technology Officer	WV Office of Technology	X	The Honorable Robert L. Morris, Jr.	WV Senate (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	James Dixon Jeff Whitman	Representing Heather Abbott	—	The Honorable Jarred Cannon	WV House (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
—	Matt Turner Vice Chancellor	WV Higher Education Policy Commission HEPC	—		WV Senate (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	Steve White Director, WVNET	Representing Matt Turner	—		WV House (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
	Representative	Agency		Representative	Agency
	Kelly Workman, Jamie Hoffmann Jim Kelsh, Peter Markham	WVDED - Office of Broadband Bowles Rice Legal Counsel		Steffani Sanders Chris Campbell Andrew Joseph	Tilson Technology Management

COUNCIL VACANCIES: Urban Business User (2 Members, Any District) and Rural Business User, District 2

Agenda Item	Details/Minutes
1. Call to Order; Roll Call; Opening Remarks	Quorum was met. Opening remarks by Chairman Bissett
2. Approval of April 2025 Meeting Minutes, and Financial Statement	April 2025 Minutes, Motion by Michael Holstine, second by Ron Pearson, Minutes to be filed.

	April 2025 Financial Statement April Expenses \$14,041.14 Balance at end of April \$746,901.00 Ookla payment will be processed in May or June. Motion by Michael Holstine, Jeff Proctor second. Approved.
3. Legislation Update	Peter Markham, Bowles Rice Legislation session wrapped up April 12, Broadband was not in the news substantially, bills were introduced but did not make it through the legislation process. Two bills that were passed: Enrolled Committee Substitute for House Bill 3144 adds a new chapter to the Code that relates to wireless facilities and infrastructure. 90 days for processing a collocation application and 150 days to process an application to deploy a new wireless facility. The bill becomes effective on July 9, 2025. Enrolled Committee Substitute for House Bill 2008 pertains to the reorganization of the Executive Branch. The Office of Broadband is to be moved under Commerce, along with WV Economic Development. The Office of Broadband Director, Kelly Workman, will report directly to the Executive Director of the Division of Economic Development. No powers or duties to change for the Office of Broadband, but the bill does charge the Executive Director of Economic Development with securing and safeguarding the data and trade secrets of broadband information. This bill becomes effective July 1, 2025.
4. Public Service Commission of West Virginia (Commission) Pole Attachment Task Force CASE NO. 24-0703-T-E-CTV-GI https://www.psc.state.wv.us/WebDocket/default.htm 5. Verizon to Acquire Frontier CASE NO 24-0853-T-PC	Jim Kelsh, Bowles Rice On August 23, 2024, the WV Public Service Commission created a task force to consider and recommend incorporating by General Order and/or rule modification to the Commission's Rules for the Government of Pole Attachments (Pole Attachment Rules), 150 C.S.R. 38. PSC staff filed a proposed procedural schedule, PSC adopted staff testimony due May 7, hearing June 3 at the PSC. Review of Kelly Workman's testimony filed on behalf of the Council; including timeliness, pole data collection database that could be implemented and built by the Office of Broadband, an annual report by each utility to find ways to correct any additional ways to improve the actions of pole owners in regard to attachments, to continue the task force on a quarterly basis. Jim Kelsh, Bowles Rice Verizon and Frontier jointly filed a petition with the WV Public Service Commission for approval of the transfer of Frontier to Verizon on October 31, 2024. The Commission recommends a decision by May 29, 2025. A focus on the settlement will include ensuring that the Frontier system can accommodate the advancement of broadband throughout the state. The Council will file rebuttal testimony next week, and a hearing has been scheduled for June 12.
6. Ookla Speed Test Update	Jamie Hoffmann, Caleb Bryant, WV Office of Broadband

	The Office of Broadband provided an overview of Low Earth Orbit (LEO) Satellite service in WV, classified by the FCC as non-geostationary satellite. Starlink is the only LEO satellite provider in WV currently. The Office shared satellite performance data as determined by Ookla speed test data. The benefits include lower initial deployment investment in higher-cost locations, although LEO service does not work well in all areas and generally is not known to support data intensive operations. Fiber networks have a longer lifespan and greater capacity for scalable and high bandwidth, data intensive performance. Overall, fiber networks are best suited for business development, enterprise uses, and most business, manufacturing and data intensive network needs. Satellites have an average five-year lifespan and are best suited for light to moderate usage.
7. IJJA NTIA: Broadband Equity, Access and Deployment (BEAD) Update	Progress Report, Kelly Workman, WV Office of Broadband Key Bead Work in West Virginia was complete. The final items pending are: - Incorporation of any Broadband Program Revision - Release Final Proposal for Public Comment and Response - Submit Final Proposal to NTIA As of the May meeting, West Virginia and all other states are anxiously awaiting BEAD program revisions, currently anticipated in June or July. When revisions are received, the Office of Broadband will update the state's program to meet requirements and determine next steps. Contingency planning is already underway, and close consultation with NTIA is essential. As determined in the 2023 Statewide Broadband Survey, affordability and reliability were the two primary factors noted by West Virginians, in addition to access. The progression of broadband in West Virginia is evident in FCC and Ookla data. Director Workman provided a review of improvements in fiber deployment and broadband speeds from 2019 to 2024. FCC fiber infrastructure has shown a 240% increase over the period. Ookla Speed Test Data in 2019 compared to 2024, shows a 70% increase in median download speeds across WV within a two-year period, and a 189% increase in the median download speed within the four-year period. Similarly, upload speeds have increased 82% in two years, and 100% over the four-period. Effects of the BEAD Program Pause Director Workman detailed the key considerations related to the program pause. These include: • Competition for Investment, Labor, Contracting, Materials and Supplies • Increased Costs • Limited Bid Hold Periods • Business Uncertainty • Time and Resources • WV Continue to Lack Broadband

8. Resolution of the West Virginia Broadband Enhancement Council read by Chairman, Bill Bissett	The Council considered a resolution in support of the continued development of broadband infrastructure in West Virginia. The resolution recognizes the work completed to date and affirms the Council's mission is to expand broadband to all West Virginians. The Council resolution emphasizes that fiber infrastructure supports economic development and emerging technologies. Chairman Bissett read a draft resolution. Motion to approve by Micheal Holstine, second by Ron Pearson. The resolution was approved and shall be signed and submitted.
---	---

Public Comment	Sign-In for Public Comment, no public comment.
Next Meeting / 10. Adjournment	Google Meet: June 12, 2025



APPROVED MEETING MINUTES/June 12, 2025

Meeting Title	WV Broadband Enhancement Council	Time	10:00 a.m.
Chairman	William D. 'Bill' Bissett, Chair	Location	Online Meeting
https://docs.google.com/forms/register Call information available upon registration.		Register for public comment. Hold comments until public comment portion of agenda.	P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent

	Member	Representing		Council Member	Representing
X	William D. (Bill) Bissett Chairman	Large Scale Broadband	—	The Honorable Scott Edwards	Rural Business User, Congressional District 1
X	Michael J. Holstine Secretary-Treasurer	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 3 / (Now Rural Residential User District 1)	—	Michael R. Graney	WVDED Acting Secretary
X	Roger Calhoun	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 3 /Now Urban Residential User (1 of 2)	X	Jeff Proctor	Vice Chairman Representing Secretary Graney
—	Michele Blatt Superintendent	WV Dept. of Education	—	Robert Cole	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 1/(Now 2)
X	Tim Conzett, WVDE Office of Data Management	Representing Michele Blatt	X	Honorable Ron Pearson	Rural Residential User Cong. Dist. 2/ Now Urban Residential User (2 of 2)
—	Heather D. Abbott Chief Technology Officer	WV Office of Technology	—	The Honorable Robert L. Morris, Jr.	WV Senate (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	James Dixon Jeff Whitman	Representing Heather Abbott	X	The Honorable Jarred Cannon	WV House (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
—	Matt Turner Vice Chancellor	WV Higher Education Policy Commission HEPC	—		WV Senate (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	Steve White Director, WVNET	Representing Matt Turner	—		WV House (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
—	Representative	Agency		Representative	Agency
—	Kelly Workman, Jamie Hoffmann Jim Kelsh, Peter Markham	WVDED - Office of Broadband Bowles Rice Legal Counsel	—	Steffani Sanders Chris Campbell Andrew Joseph	Tilson Technology Management

COUNCIL VACANCIES: Urban Business User (2 Members, Any District) and Rural Business User, District 2

Agenda Item	Details/Minutes
1. Call to Order; Roll Call; Opening Remarks	Quorum met

2. Approval of May 2025 Meeting Minutes, and Financial Statement	Michael Holstine Approved, Jeffrey Proctor seconded. May 2025 Minutes to be filed. Financial Statement by Sabrina Stollings Beginning Balance May 1 2025: \$746,901.58 Tilson Invoice: \$562.50 Ookla Invoice: \$196,965.00 ESRI: \$1,200.00 Total Expenses for May: \$198,727.50 Ending Balance for May 2025: \$548,174.80 No questions. Motion from Roger Calhoun, second by Michael Holstine. Financial Report Approved,
3. Public Service Commission of West Virginia (Commission) Pole Attachment Task Force CASE NO. 24-0703-T-E-CTV-GI Designation of Council representative(s). https://www.psc.state.wv.us/WebDocket/default.htm	Peter Markham, Bowles Rice On August 23, 2024, the WVPSC created a task force to consider and recommend incorporating by General Order and/or rule modification to the Commission's Rules for the Government of Pole Attachments (Pole Attachment Rules), 150 C.S.R. 38. • Final Report Issued January 31, 2025 • Pole Attachment Rules Task Force Order April 29, 2025 • Pole Attachment Rules Task Force Hearing June 3, 2025 Evidentiary Hearing, the PSC has adopted several recommendations from the Task Force's Final Report, such as the informal dispute process, rule revisions that mirror some FCC rule updates. First, require pole owners to do their pole audits with more detail. Second, the Council has suggested the creation of a database for pole permitting throughout the state. Third, Pole owners report annually. Lastly, the Council asked the PSC to continue working group to help address recurring issues, make ready issues and monitor updates as rules may change in the future. The PSC is moving expeditiously on this issue. In a separate matter, another company, DQE, advocated temporary attachments to speed up their projects. A decision on this matter will be included with the consolidated order to be issued soon. The Council and the Office appreciate the Commission's thorough review of this matter and recent progress in favor of broadband expansion.
4. Verizon to Acquire Frontier CASE NO 24-0853-T-PC: https://www.psc.state.wv.us/WebDocket/default.htm	Peter Markham, Bowles Rice Verizon and Frontier jointly filed a petition with the WV Public Service Commission for approval of the transfer of Frontier to Verizon on October 31, 2024. • Evidentiary/Settlement Hearing June 12, 2025 If the PSC approves the acquisition of Frontier by Verizon, the PSC can attach certain conditions. The Council offered input on some conditions. Under the settlement agreement, Verizon would be required to collect the uniform pole inspection data and report it to be placed in the proposed pole permit tracker/database. Also, Verizon would be required to continue both grant funded and non-grant funded projects with Frontier to make sure that all progress moves forward. Other conditions are that Verizon offer low-income packages in WV, and that they report the outcomes of those programs, and that they

	continue work on pole attachments per set guidelines as a member of the working group, as approved and applicable. The settlement also includes assurances that if the acquisition goes through, Verizon is required to honor Frontier's commitments and also continue to build out a robust broadband program.
5. ARPA Project Update	Progress Report: Jamie Hoffmann Nearing the deadline to disburse all funds within our ARPA portfolio which is over \$200 million in infrastructure. As of May 2025, nearly 6,000 locations served, with 39,000 as the goal. Progress is slower than planned due to pole attachment issues. Our goal is to close all pole make-ready by the end of 2025, that way 2026 will be a good platform to complete all projects. Striving to get the live dashboard for when service is available in their area.
8. IJA NTIA: Broadband Equity, Access and Deployment (BEAD) Update	New NTIA BEAD Program Notice Issued June 6: Chris Campbell Major development from NTIA policy notice with significant changes to the BEAD program. Presentation to explain rough outline of requirements by the Office of Broadband to conform to the policy notice changes. Released June 6, 2025, Required: Initial Proposal Correction within 30 days of June 6, Revised list of Target Locations for additional application round, Final Proposal submission with updated award recommendations due within 90 days, September 3, 2025. 1. Target Location Revisions - WVDED must remove to match the latest FCC Broadband Serviceable Locations Fabric, previously at version 2, now at version 6. 2. Eliminated/Reduced Requirements - States must rescind all preliminary and provisional subaward selections. NTIA rescinds approval for all non-deployment activities, future guidance to come from NTIA. Policy Notice reduced requirements: labor, employment and workforce development; climate change, Open access, local coordination and stakeholder engagement, non-traditional broadband providers, middle class affordability, explicit rates for a low-cost service option. 3. Permitting - NTIA Goal: NEPA approvals within 2 weeks for 90% of projects, WVDED must use the ESAPPT Tool within NTIA Grant Portal, ESAPPT will identify applicable categorical exclusions, retain project records from subgrant award data, track subrecipient milestone schedules. 4. Application Changes - "Priority Broadband Projects" Previously defined from end-to-end fiber projects, to now: 100/20 Mbps, Latency less than or equal to 100 milliseconds and can easily scale speeds over time, regardless of technology used. 5. Revised Scoring - WVDED must conduct one additional round of subgrantee selection for every location, reopen pre-application portal for new applicants, rescore all applications prioritizing low-cost projects, no specific maximum per location cost for projects, competing proposals to be compared by assessing total BEAD funding and cost to the Program per location.

	6. Existing Applicants - they can elect to maintain applications already submitted or submit revised project costs, do not need to resubmit pre-application, all applications will be rescored with updated criteria, can submit revised proposals due to the removal of some project costs, applicants can also propose to exclude locations that are considered “high-cost” 7. Alternative Technologies - Any technology that meets speed, latency and scaling standards, NTIA has rescinded prior guidance on Alternative Technologies, BEAD subgrants awarded to LEO (low earth orbit) will be considered LEO Capacity Grants, WVDED would reserve sufficient capacity from the LEO provider to deliver service in the area. 8. LEO Capacity Subgrants - Service within 4 years, 10 years performance, options for reimbursements in installments and advances, Opportunity to reduce Letter of Credit in proportion to subscription rates, consumer premise equipment at no cost. 9. Next Steps - Immediate steps to comply with NTIA Policy Notice required timeline, Target location revision, will issue 2 notices to ISPs and an information request.
--	--

9. Public Comment	Sign-In for Public Comment, No public comment
Next Meeting / 10. Adjournment	Google Meet: July 10, 2025 (Note, the July and August meetings were cancelled.)



WEST VIRGINIA BROADBAND ENHANCEMENT COUNCIL

APPROVED MEETING MINUTES: September 11, 2025

Regular Meeting	WV Broadband Enhancement Council	Time	10:00 a.m.
Chairman	William D. 'Bill' Bissett, Chair	Location	Online Meeting
https://docs.google.com/forms/register Call information available upon registration.		Register for public comment. Hold comments until public comment portion of agenda.	P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent

	Council Member	Representing		Council Member	Representing
X	William D. (Bill) Bissett Chairman	Large Scale Broadband Users	—	The Honorable Scott Edwards	Rural Business User Congressional District 1
X	Michael J. Holstine Secretary-Treasurer	Rural Residential User Congressional District 1	—	Todd Hooker	WVDED Executive Director
X	Roger Calhoun	Urban Residential User (1 of 2)	X	Jeff Proctor	Vice Chairman Representing Director Hooker
—	Michele Blatt Superintendent	WV Dept. of Education	—	Robert Cole	Rural Residential User Congressional District 2
X	Tim Conzett, WVDE Office of Data Management	Representing Michele Blatt	X	Honorable Ron Pearson	Urban Residential User (2 of 2)
—	Heather D. Abbott Chief Technology Officer	WV Office of Technology	X	Honorable Robert L. Morris, Jr.	WV Senate (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	James Dixon Jeff Whitman	Representing Heather Abbott	—	Honorable Jarred Cannon	WV House (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
—	Matt Turner Vice Chancellor	WV Higher Education Policy Commission HEPC	—		WV Senate (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
X	Steve White Director, WVNET	Representing Matt Turner	—		WV House (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
—	Representative	Agency		Representative	Agency
—	Kelly Workman Jim Kelsh, Peter Markham	WVDED - Office of Broadband Bowles Rice Legal Counsel	—	Chris Campbell, Steffani Sanders Jeff Hartley	Tilson Technology Management The Thrasher Group

COUNCIL VACANCIES: Urban Business User (2 Members, Any District) and Rural Business User, District 2

Agenda Item	Details/Minutes
1. Call to Order; Roll Call; Opening Remarks	Chairman Bissett opened the call with a welcome to our Cabinet Secretary Matt Herridge and expressed enthusiasm for broadband developments in West Virginia and the state's future. Quorum met, approved by Michael Holstine, seconded by Jeff Proctor.

2. Approval of June 2025 Meeting Minutes, and Financial Statement	Financial Statement was missed in this meeting. June 2025 Minutes reviewed, Michael Holstine first, Jeff Proctor second. Minutes approved.
3. Public Service Commission of West Virginia (Commission) Pole Attachment Orders https://www.psc.state.wv.us/WebDocket/default.htm	Peter Markham, Bowles Rice 1. Pole Attachment Task Force, CASE NO. 24-0703-T-E-CTV-GI. June 27 the PSC hard order, lists at least 8 issues for Broadband in WV. 1. Pole attachment working group, PSC directed the working group to meet at least quarterly. 2. Organization of pole attachments with a database. 3. Requires pole owners to supply uniform information, such as estimated costs. 4. Requires pole owners to file annual reports. 5. Rule making to efficiently handle temporary poles and attachments. 6. Dial up or cable for use where appropriate 7. Pole owners 60 days notice required for work on major projects. 8. Apply FCC compliance and cost share or allocation. The next working group meeting will be held in November 2025. 2. Comcast v. APCO-CASE NO. 25-0463-CTV-E-POLE Comcast filed a complaint against APCO's policy of shifting pre-existing pole violation costs to new attachers. The commission ruled against Appco, finding their policy violated pole attachment rules by denying access, charging for pre-existing violations, and delaying make-ready construction. APCO and Comcast were ordered to complete make-ready construction by January 31, 2026, and pole replacements by October 31, 2025, and January 21, 2026, respectively. 3. Citynet v. Monongahela Power Company and FirstEnergy Citynet alleges unlawful charges for make-ready construction and pre-existing violations, seeking a \$12 million refund. Citynet also claims that competitors are allowed unsafe attachments, creating an unfair advantage. An evidentiary hearing is scheduled for October 16, with a commission order expected in late fall or early winter. 4. Verizon to Acquire Frontier, CASE NO 24-0853-T-PC June 2025, the parties offered an agreement to settle. Settlement still pending. Verizon will continue Frontier's projects, and state that they will continue high speed fiber projects in WV.
5. ARPA Project Update	Progress Report: Jeff Hartley, The Thrasher Group over \$25 million in funding has been allocated, and five additional projects were awarded, bringing the total to 47. The total investment is nearly \$247 million, with \$20.6 million in state and local physical recovery funds and \$15.1 million in capital projects funds reimbursed to providers. Currently, 8,765 locations have received service, 22

	projects are in active construction, and 10 of the 16 projects in permitting and design are expected to begin construction in October. ARPA Project Progress and Challenges: While 22 projects are in active construction, pole permitting remains the biggest delay, with some projects waiting six months for permits. Providers are focusing on fiber deployment before winter, with splicing to occur during the winter months, leading to a delay in updated address numbers until fiber is lit. Senator Robbie Morris clarified that ARPA is a reimbursement program, meaning the \$247 million is allocated but only \$35 million has been disbursed to companies so far.
8. IJIA NTIA: Broadband Equity, Access and Deployment (BEAD) Update	Progress Report: Chris Campbell, Tilson Final proposal for deployment submitted. BEAD Restructuring Notice from NTIA June 2025. Initial locations BEAD eligibility, 114,1478 locations in original application. 40,618 locations from the original list were not awarded for various reasons, primarily because they were identified as not broadband serviceable locations (BSLs) in later fabric versions or had become served by other projects. Many are now already served or included in funded projects. 5 new ARPA projects were awarded, so these locations were also removed from BEAD. 73,560 locations are now considered eligible (subject to revision). 9 ISPs were provisionally selected to serve these locations. CityNet and Frontier awarded the two largest amount of by locations. A story map is available on the Council website: https://storymaps.arcgis.com/stories/a40af24f225b4d04a2702b113121c502 Upon NTIA approval, executed agreements will likely begin in 2026, and companies typically have four years to complete projects, with a possibility for a one-year extension.

Public Comment	Sign-In for Public Comment
Next Meeting / 10. Adjournment	Google Meet: October 9, 2025 Motion for adjournment: Michael Holstine, first, second _____?