



WEST VIRGINIA BROADBAND ENHANCEMENT COUNCIL

DRAFT MINUTES | November 14, 2019

Meeting Title	WV Broadband Enhancement Council	Time	10:00 a.m.
Chairman	Robert Hinton	Location	Capitol Complex, Bldg. 3, First Floor
		Attendance	P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent

	Council Member	Representing			Council Member	Representing
P	Robert Hinton, Chairman	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 2	-	-	C. Edward Gaunch	WV Dept. of Commerce, Cabinet Secretary
P	Robert Morris, Vice Chairman	Urban Residential User	p	-	Jeff Proctor	Representing Secretary Gaunch
TC	Michael J. Holstine Secretary-Treasurer	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 3	-	-	The Honorable Robert Plymale	WV Senate (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
-	Robert Cole	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 1	-	-	The Honorable Daniel Linville	WV House (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
-	R.A. "Pete" Hobbs	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 3	-	-	The Honorable Craig Blair	WV Senate (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
-	Dr. Steven L. Paine	Dept. of Education, State Superintendent	-	-	The Honorable Kenneth Hicks	WV House (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
P	Brenda Morris	Representing Dr. Paine	p	-	William D. "Bill" Bissett	Urban Business User
P	Joshua D. Spence	WV Office of Technology, Chief Technology Officer	p	-	Dennis Lee	Business User, Large Scale Broadband
-	James Dixon	Representing Joshua Spence	p	-	Honorable Ronald G. Pearson	Rural Residential User Cong. Dist. 2
-	Matt Turner	Higher Education Policy Commission Vice Chancellor	-	-	Vacancy: Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 1	
P	Dr. Carl Powell	Representing Matt Turner	-	-		
	Representative	Agency			Representative	Agency
-	Mitch Blake	Director, WVGES	p	-	Tony Simental	WV GES, Office of GIS Coordination
TC	Chris Campbell	Tilson Technology Management	-	-	Kelli Talbott	WV Attorney General's Office Legal Counsel
-	Peter Markham	Bowles Rice Legal Counsel	-	-	Wes White	WV Development Office Legal Counsel
P	Alexandra Shulz	Bowles Rice Legal Counsel	p	-	CarolAnn Williams	WV Development Office GIS Manager, Broadband
P	Tony O'Leary	WV Development Office Development Manager	p	-	Kelly Workman	WV Development Office Administrative Director

Agenda Item	Details/Minutes
1. Call to Order, Opening Remarks; Roll Call	Chair Hinton called the meeting to order at 10:04 a.m. and requested a moment of silence in commemoration of the anniversary of the 1970 Marshall University plane crash.
2. Approval of 10/10/2019 Council Meeting Minutes and Financial Statement	Robert Morris made a motion to accept the October 2019 meeting minutes; Bill Bissett second; motion passed unanimously.
3. Website; Mapping Demo; Five-Year Plan Survey Distribution and Responses to Date, Speedtest Survey and Dashboard	CarolAnn Williams, GIS Manager with the WV Development Office presented on several Council initiatives being conducted through the Council website. Mrs. Williams gave an overview of the new Council Website which was published on October 28 th , demonstrating the updated features and functionality. Mrs. Williams provided an update on the Five-Year Plan surveys to date. Chairman Hinton proposed that the surveys remain live after the initial end-date to continue collecting data beyond the Five-Year Plan deadline requirement. Another demonstration was given of a Speedtest and FCC 477 comparison dashboard, current features and next steps were presented to the Council.

<p>4. 2020-2025 State Broadband Plan</p>	<p>Elin Katz – Associate General Counsel with Tilson Technology - gave an overview of the 2020-2025 State Broadband Plan draft. Ms. Katz said the draft plan follows the goals and objectives established by a Council committee which met first in April 2019 and had several subsequent meetings. The plan provides a summary of the current state of broadband initiatives in the state including recent policy updates and legislative directives and provides goals and strategies for improving infrastructure and adoption in the state.</p> <p>Jeff Proctor made a motion to approve the draft to form, with the understanding that modifications will be made, and make it available for public comment. Mr. Morris second; motion passed unanimously.</p>
<p>5. WV PSC Pole Attachment Proceedings</p>	<p>Alexandra Shulz of Bowles Rice provided an overview of initial comments submitted to the PSC’s Proposed Rules for Pole Attachments put forth in October 2019. Ms. Shulz said the PSC proposed rules were in line with what the Broadband Council recommended with its comments.</p>
<p>6. Council Draft Request for Information (RFI) incorporating Utility Feasibility Study needs.</p>	<p>Eric Miller, principal consultant for Tilson Technology, gave an update to the Council’s Request for Information to collect input from providers for the state broadband plan and to identify potential partnerships to deliver enhanced broadband services in the state. Mr. Ellis said about a dozen providers responded to the RFI, detailing what they could provide for enhance broadband buildout and what they seek from the state to expand broadband services, notably to the state’s underserved and unserved areas. After much discussion between Council members and Tilson representatives, Chair Hinton said the Council should consider creating a special working session solely dedicated to discuss the many points derived from the RFI responses.</p>
<p>7. AEP Broadband Feasibility Study Scheduled to begin at 11:00 a.m.</p>	<p>Appalachian Power Company officials discussed the company’s feasibility study submitted to the West Virginia Broadband Enhancement Council in October, pursuant to West Virginia Code Sec. 31G-4-5.</p> <p>Brad Hall, Vice President of External Affairs, said the company’s feasibility study stated that APCO can bring a connectivity solution to delivering broadband connectivity to rural WV. Mr. Hall said this could be done by deploying fiber for middle-mile connectivity on the company’s expansive infrastructure assets throughout the state. Mr. Hall said the company is not interested in being a service provider but willing to lease its middle-mile fiber assets to companies that can provide last-mile service. Mr. Hall said the company has selected Mingo and Logan counties as the first locales to conduct a pilot project to lease its fiber to an internet service provider to deliver broadband connectivity. Mr. Hall said the company’s next step is to secure an ISP.</p> <p>Ken Perdue, Director of Telecommunications Engineering for APCO, provided more specific details of where the proposed pilot would be located based off the feasibility study.</p> <p>Steve Ferguson, Vice President of Regulatory Services and Finance, provided a breakdown of the projected buildout costs and costs to customers.</p> <p>Jim Bacha, Associate General Counsel, spoke to the legal matters associated with the pilot project once it is underway.</p> <p>Following a discussion period between APCO officials and Council members, Jim Kelsh of Bowles Rice reviewed one written comment on the study which he said was supportive of the feasibility study. Mr. Kelsh said the process requires the Council to act on the study within 60 days of its release. He said he hopes to present a proposal at the December 12 Council meeting that identifies structure for the next steps in the process.</p>
<p>8. Review of Environmental and Permitting Requirements</p>	<p>Chair Hinton announced there would be an Infrastructure Committee Meeting on Wednesday, November 20, 2019 at 1:00 p.m.</p>

9. Public Comment	John Tuggle, Director of Region IV Planning and Development Council and member of the Regional Optimal Communications organization, commented that performance measures for the APCO feasibility project should be strongly considered and measured to ensure consumers get satisfactory service, adding that an entity be responsible to monitor the performance measurables stated any contract.			
10. Next Meeting Date	December 12, 2019; 10:00 a.m.; Building 3, First Floor Conf. Room 124			
11. Adjournment	Chair Hinton adjourned the meeting at 12:57 p.m.			
Action Items				
No.	Description	Assigned To	Month Identified	Target Completion Date
1.	Legal and Cooperative Toolkit and Training	WVU Law	June 2017	Underway
2.	Broadband Hub ARC Broadband Hub/Mapping Project	T. Simental, K. Workman, C. Williams	November 2018	Target completion November 2019
3.	Website Updates-Speed test survey updates, map updates	Commerce, C. Williams	December 2018	Complete
4.	NTIA/National Broadband Availability Map	T. Simental, K. Workman, C. Williams	February 2019	5/10/2019 Initial Data From Phase One States
5.	Guide to Broadband Development	WVDO	February 2019	December - 2019
6.	2020-2025 State Broadband Plan	Steering Committee, Staff	March 2019	Draft Complete November 2019 Final December 2019