



West Virginia Broadband Enhancement Council Approved Meeting Minutes September 14, 2017



Meeting Title	WV Broadband Enhancement Council Meeting		
Chairperson	Robert Hinton		
Date	9/14/1017	Location	WV Capitol Complex Bldg. 3, Suite 800 Conference Room
Time	9:00 am		
Audio Connection	304.957.6999 Conf. ID: 935-9172#		P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent

	Council Member	Representing		Council Member	Representing
P	Robert Hinton, Chairman	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 2	-	Woody Thrasher	Dept. of Commerce, Cabinet Secretary
P	Robert Morris, Vice Chairman	Urban Residential User	P	Jeff Proctor	Representing Woody Thrasher
-	Michael L. Holstine Secretary-Treasurer	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 3	-	Dr. Steven L. Paine	Dept. of Education, State Superintendent
-	Ric Cavender	Urban Business User	P	Brenda Morris	Representing Dr. Steven L. Paine
-	Robert Cole	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 1	P	The Honorable Glenn Jeffries	WV Senate (Dem. Party) (ex-officio/non-voting member)
P	John Dunlap	Office of Technology, Chief Technology Officer	TC	The Honorable Craig Blair	WV Senate (Rep. Party) (ex-officio/non-voting member)
P	R.A. "Pete" Hobbs	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 3	-	Vacant	WV House (Dem. Party) (ex-officio/non-voting member)
TC	John Reasbeck	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 1	-	Vacant	WV House (Rep. Party) (ex-officio/non-voting member)
P	Matt Turner	Higher Education Policy Comm., Exec. Vice Chancellor	-	Brittany Carns	Business User of Large Amounts of Broadband
P	Dr. Jack Smith	Representing Matt Turner	-	Michael Shaffer	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 2
	Representative	Agency		Representative	Agency
P	Mark Debruyne	WV Office of Technology	P	Tony Simental	WV Geological and Economic Survey, Office of GIS Coordination
P	Michael Hohn	WV Geological and Economic Survey	P	Will Valentino	WV Attorney General's Office, Legal Counsel
P	Josh Jarrell	WV Dept. of Commerce, Deputy Sec., Legal Counsel	P	Kelly Workman	WVDO Staff Liaison
P	Tony O'Leary	WVDO Staff Liaison			

Agenda Item	Details/Minutes
1. Call to Order	Chair Hinton called the meeting to order at 9:06 a.m.
2. Opening Remarks and Roll Call	Roll was taken and the presence of a quorum was confirmed.

<p>3. Approval of Minutes: 8/10/2017 Council Meeting, Financial Statement</p>	<p>Minutes from the August 10, 2017 Council meeting were presented for approval, along with a current financial statement. Member R. Morris moved that both documents be approved and Member Hobbs provided a second. Motion carried.</p>
<p>4. Cooperatives</p>	<p>The Council's FAQ was accepted and was posted to the website, and is available for distribution. The FAQ is the first component of a Cooperative toolkit that will be further developed. In this regard, Mark DeBruyn with the WV Office of Technology provided an overview of his consultations with communities and residents who have expressed interest in forming cooperatives. Member R. Morris thanked Mr. DeBruyn for this work.</p> <p>To continue developing this initiative, The Council is undertaking the following next steps:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identification of partners, including Generation West Virginia and other organizations and agencies, such as the WVU Entrepreneurship and Innovation Law Clinic, for the development of a toolkit, training program and additional resources. • Connection of residents and interested providers.
<p>5. Draft WVBEC-WVEDA Broadband Infrastructure Loan Insurance Program Guide</p>	<p>The \$50 million Broadband Infrastructure Loan Program to expand service throughout West Virginia, was officially launched September 1, 2017, following the August 10, 2017, review and approval of the initial program guide and forms. Under the proposed framework, the Council will be responsible for the certification of eligibility, and applicants will pursue independent financial review by a commercial lender and the WVEDA. Applications for certification of eligibility will be submitted to the Council, via the Department of Commerce on or before the 15th day of each month. The Council approved the concept and composition of the Technical Review Committee, which will evaluate projects according to the requirements of HB3093, and provide a summary report to the full Council for review and action. The Technical Review Committee will evaluate the preliminary design, mapping data, rate structures and other factors.</p> <p>The Chairman noted that the technical review committee will provide a summary and recommendations to the Council for review and discussion. Applications that are not deemed sufficient will be subject to further review or returned for revisions.</p> <p>It was noted that certain requirements are not addressed through legislation, and the Council will need to work through these procedures. The Council's goal is to be as efficient as possible while ensuring that all program requirements are met.</p>
<p>6. Speed Test Portal Demo</p>	<p>Mr. Hohn and Mr. Simental provided an overview of two main components of the Interactive Broadband Mapping System: (1) Speed Test Portal, and (2) Statewide Broadband Map.</p> <p>The Speed Test has been installed on State (WVOT) servers. The Ookla speed test will default to the nearest server, therefore, Mr. Simental recommended rotating the server every 30 days. The Speed Test is using the same platform as the NC test, as previously directed. To capture service tiers, the test is utilizing tiers on a temporary basis until the auto population function is available. WVGES is still working with ESRI on this function.</p> <p>Address information will be collected by the system. The user may either enter their address or use the map arrow function. The map is optimized to work on mobile devices. A comment box has also been added. Member Holstine asked if information is collected even if the speed test is not successful. It was noted that WVGES should add an entry point for the survey only, without the speed test.</p>

	<p>Analytics will be provided to the Council monthly, and this data is not public information. Reports will also differentiate between wireless and fixed test data.</p> <p>It was noted that the speed test is live on the WVBECC website and is considered 95 percent complete. The goal is for the speed test to be an evolving process which will be modified based upon public input and improved through additional functionality in cooperation with ESRI. The most important feature to be added through continued development is the auto-populate function.</p> <p>Member Cole thanked the WVGES for their work on this project. Mr. Hohn noted that the WVGES team, including but not limited to John Bocan and Rich Binz, were integral in the development of the system.</p>
<p>7. Interactive Broadband Mapping System</p>	<p>Mr. Hohn provided an update of the Mapping System, indicating that WVGES has made considerable progress on this project. Mr. Hohn noted that the FCC data is less than perfect and that duplicate data had to be corrected and this required a considerable amount of time. Color codes were indicated as follows: Blue = faster areas (25:3); yellow = slower service (10:1) ; Cyan = lower service (4:1); and no color = no service. The FCC data is presented by census block. The WVGES optimized speed by eliminating mapping outside of the viewed area.</p> <p>Member Proctor asked which data set is being utilized, and Mr. Hohn confirmed that this is the most recent data from December 2016. Mr. Simental stated that the map does not include wireless data, and the most recent mobile data is from 2015.</p> <p>Chair Hinton requested two separate maps: one for fixed service and one for wireless.</p> <p>Member Proctor asked about mapping Ookla data. Mr. Simental explained that this data is proprietary, and that the agreement states that raw data cannot be released. However, summary data can be released.</p> <p>Member R. Morris asked if the WVGES would have to update the map corresponding with FCC updates. Mr. Simental affirmed and indicated that the map should be updated every 6 months.</p> <p>There was a question about showing other states' data and Mr. Hohn stated that WVGES could query FCC data if needed. Mr. Simental stated that the map merges all census blocks, but the user can click to show census block boundaries. He noted that the map is currently a transparent map, but it can be attenuated if needed. The map can also be enhanced to show providers in the census blocks and advertised speeds. WVGES is in contact with ESRI, and can currently see providers in each area.</p> <p>Mr. Hohn anticipated that the initial mapping project will be completed in October 2017. Mr. Simental noted that all data is cloud based, for speed and reduced cost. WVOT has purchased the ESRI online license for \$3,000 with additional credits for \$3,000 for one year, as opposed to the initial estimate of \$23,000.</p> <p>The Chairman noted that the Council will need to purchase the Ookla license in early 2018. In early 2018, the Council will be able to draw comparisons between advertised data and actual data. Ookla provides a centroid of a town, but will not identify a particular site. The Chairman asked if the Council can compare speeds by address, and Mr. Simental noted that data can be compared by lat-long, but may take more time.</p>

	<p>Member Dunlap noted that the Council had initially contemplated two server sites. Mr. Simental confirmed that at least three sites are needed, suggesting the Eastern Panhandle or Morgantown.</p> <p>The Council agreed to add additional server sites. The Chairman thanked Mr. Hohn and Mr. Simental for their work on this project.</p>
<p>8. FCC Notice of Proposed Rulemaking</p>	<p>The Council was provided with a draft of a formal comment regarding the following notice of proposed rulemaking by the FCC:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. FCC CAFII Public Notice for Competitive Bidding Procedures, Connect America Fund Phase II Auction (Auction 903), WC Docket No. 10-90; Document Number 2017-18041. Comments are due September 18, 2017. <p>Relative to the FCC open comment for CAF II Funding, which will allocate nearly \$2 billion nationwide, \$200 million per year, through reverse auction, the Chairman noted that the Council will request that certain census blocks be included in the auction if construction has not started. Moreover, the practice of constructing service at the 10:1 level does not adequately serve the needs of State residents and businesses. West Virginia has one of the worst connectivity rates in the nation, ranking 48th among all states for connectivity. The Council asserts that these census blocks should be opened to improve competition and service options. There was discussion concerning the process for final revisions. Member Proctor made a motion that the Chairman would be responsible for final revisions and Member Hobbs provided a second. Motion carried.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 2. Modernizing the FCC Form 477 Data Program, WC Docket No. 11-10; Document Number 2017-17901. Comments due October 9, 2017. <p>This notice of proposed rulemaking concerned the FCC practice of designating service for an entire census block based upon a limited and flawed dataset. The Council requests that the FCC improve this process, and recognize alternate data sources. Member Proctor made a motion that the Chairman would be responsible for writing and submitting this letter. Member R. Morris provided a second. Motion carried.</p>
<p>9. WVBEC MOU with WV Dept. of Transportation, Division of Highways</p>	<p>The Chairman presented a draft MOU between the Council and the WVDOT-Division of Highways. This MOU will enable the Council and the WVDOT to cooperatively develop State policy for the utilization of the State road right of way for fiber installation. The Council seeks to encourage investment in the State by long-haul fiber network providers to improve connectivity throughout WV.</p> <p>The Council and WVDO will determine whether such an approach required policy development or legislation. The Council seeks a policy for marketing, with the Council acting as first point of contact for fiber projects. Through the MOU, review of rate structures and policies among contiguous states will be reviewed.</p> <p>Sen. Jeffries also suggested review of policy for pipeline ROWs, and other utilities including railroads. Member Proctor made a motion that the Council execute the MOU with WVDOT. Member Holstine provided a second and the motion carried.</p>
<p>10. Marketing</p>	<p>Samantha Smith, Director, and Jordan Ferrell, project manager, for Commerce Communications provided an overview of available services. With the integration of the speed test, mapping and other initiatives, the WVDO has recommended that the Council pursue development of a new website, utilizing Commerce resources for the website, logo</p>

	<p>development, newsletter, media and messaging. Ms. Workman and Mr. O’Leary will continue to manage website content on CEMS craft platform. Commerce will provide search engine optimization, Google analytics, photography, and other resources. Additional marketing services were included with an initial cost estimate of \$2,500.</p> <p>This proposal will provide additional services to the Council. The estimated timeframe for website development is 16 weeks at a cost of \$18,000 to \$20,000. Ongoing fees will fluctuate depending upon site maintenance. Member R. Morris noted that the cost estimate appears reasonable. Member Holstine made a motion to accept the proposal as presented. Member Dunlap requested an MOU and Ms. Smith indicated that an agreement would be provided. Member Hobbs provided a second, and the motion carried.</p>
11. Committee Reports	<p>There was discussion of travel for training and the Council reiterated that travel over and above regular Council meetings should not be reimbursed.</p> <p>Committee reports were provided. Chair Hinton detailed work of the Infrastructure Committee and its specific initiative related to WVDOT agreements, utilization of roadbed rights of way, pipelines, and a Dig Once/Trench Once policy. Each aspect of this work would contribute to a State policy that would capitalize on road construction, similar to the IJDC policy regarding the installation of water and sewer infrastructure.</p> <p>Member Turner provided an Education Committee report, noting that the committee met in August to address the initial issue concerning lack of connectivity for higher education. The committee is working on gathering facts related to education and plans to add the Library Commission to it membership. The Committee plans to review the State E-Rate, K-12 and WVNet at subsequent meetings.</p> <p>Member Cole provided an overview of the Adoption Committee in its effort to improve take rates by educating the public through a training program, which may involve having college students conduct training and using existing kiosks to distribute information.</p> <p>There was discussion of co-locating infrastructure on State-owned towers. Mr. Jack Smith stated that Homeland Security (DHSEM) took over (BTOP?) towers. It was noted that FirstNet can utilize State towers, providing no public access on the system. There was a recommendation to inquire with WVARNG regarding opportunities to create more open access for co-location.</p> <p>Member Hobbs informed the Council of the fiber build in Galax, Virginia, known as The Wired Road, which is considered a very successful model.</p> <p>All committee meetings are posted to the Secretary of State website as they are scheduled.</p>
12. Public Comments	There were no public comments.
13. Next Meeting Date and Proposed Agenda	October 19, 2017
Adjournment	The meeting was adjourned at 11:20 a.m.

Action Items				
No.	Description	Assigned To	Month Identified	Target Completion Date
1.	Review of resources for easement acquisition.	Adoption Committee, Hobbs	May	September
2.	Consultation with WV DOH	Council, WVDO, WVOT, WV DOT	May	Underway
3.	Website – Marketing	WVOT, WVDO	May	Underway, First Newsletter September 2017
4.	Council requested that committee work to address requirements of HB3093.	All Committees	June	August - September
5.	Mapping System and Speed Test Portal	Council, WVGES, WVOT	June	October

Others Present (in order of sign-in sheet):

1. **Rick Stonestreet, AARP**
2. **Chris Dalzell, Roane County Broadband Committee**
3. **Eric Price, Thompson, Litton Engineering**
4. **Mark Polen, WV Cable Telecom Association**
5. **Bradley Andrews, ACLC, LLC**
6. **Holly Clark, Richwood Scientific**
7. **Bill Gross, Roane County Broadband Committee**
8. **Billy Jack Greg, Frontier Communications**
9. **John Golden, DAS Advisors**
10. **James Bailey, WV Senate**
11. **Chris Morris, CityNet**
12. **Charlie Dennie, Alpha Technologies**
13. **Max Garland, WV Gazette**
14. **Aaron Spork, Office of Sen. Shelley Moore Capito**

**Meeting Minutes prepared by:
Kelly Workman, WVDO**