

# WV Broadband Enhancement Council Meeting Agenda / Minutes



|                         |  |                         |  |
|-------------------------|--|-------------------------|--|
| <b>Meeting Title</b>    | WV Broadband Enhancement Council Meeting |                         |  |
| <b>Chairperson</b>      | Robert Hinton                            |                         |  |
| <b>Date</b>             | October 20, 2016                         | <b>Location</b>         | WV Capitol Complex<br>Building 6, 6 <sup>th</sup> Floor, Conf. Rm. A |
| <b>Time</b>             | 9:00 am                                  |                         |  |
| <b>Audio connection</b> | 304.957.6999<br>Conf. ID: 3750172        | <b>Video connection</b> | via <a href="#">Microsoft Outlook Live Meeting</a>                   |

|    | <b>Council Member</b>                     | <b>Representing</b>                             |   | <b>Council Member</b>                                  | <b>Representing</b>                                      |
|----|---|---|---|--|--|
| P  | Robert Hinton,<br>Chairman                | Rural Business User<br>Congressional Dist. 2    | P | Josh Jarrell attending<br>for J. Keith Burdette        | Dept of Commerce,<br>Cabinet Secretary                   |
| P  | Robert Morris,<br>Vice Chairman           | Urban Residential User                          | P | Gale Given   | Office of Technology,<br>Chief Technology Officer        |
| TC | Alissa Novoselick,<br>Secretary/Treasurer | Urban Business User                             | P | Brenda Morris<br>attending for Michael<br>J. Martirano | Dept. of Education,<br>State Superintendent              |
| P  | Robert Cole                               | Rural Residential User<br>Congressional Dist. 1 | - | Matt Turner  | Higher Education Policy Comm.,<br>Exec. Vice Chancellor  |
| P  | Michael Shaffer                           | Rural Residential User<br>Congressional Dist. 2 | - | Vacant   | WV Senate (Dem. Party)<br>(ex-officio/non-voting member) |
| P  | R.A. "Pete" Hobbs                         | Rural Residential User<br>Congressional Dist. 3 | - | Vacant   | WV Senate (Rep. Party)<br>(ex-officio/non-voting member) |
| TC | John Reasback                             | Rural Business User<br>Congressional Dist. 1    | - | Vacant   | WV House (Dem. Party)<br>(ex-officio/non-voting member)  |
| TC | Michael J. Holstine                       | Rural Business User<br>Congressional Dist. 3    | - | Vacant   | WV House (Rep. Party)<br>(ex-officio/non-voting member)  |
| -  | Brittany Carns                            | Business User of Large<br>Amounts of Broadband  | - |  |  |
| -  |   |   | - |  |  |

P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; \_ = Absent

## Agenda (Topics and Minutes)

| <b>Topic</b>                                     | <b>Details/Minutes</b>  |
|--|---|
| <b>Opening Remarks</b>                           | -   |
| <b>Minutes from the October 20, 2016 Meeting</b> | The meeting was called to order by Chairman Hinton and it was determined that a quorum was present. Mr. Cole moved for the approval of the September 6, 2016, meeting minutes. Motion seconded by Mr. Morris. The minutes were approved as presented. |

|  |  |
|--|--|
| <p><b>Discussion</b></p>   | <p>Chairman Hinton advised that the funds available that were transferred from the Department of Commerce is \$1.464 million and the funds available through the Budget Bill is \$1.887 million. Mr. Jarrell explained that the funds in the Budget Bill is actually just spending authority up to that amount. The only funds available for the council to utilize are the ones transferred from the Department of Commerce. Those may be spent in accordance with the Council's duties. The entire funds do not have to be spent this year, they can be re-appropriated and utilized in future years.</p>  |
|  | <p>Mr. Cole made a motion to elect Alissa Novoselick the permanent Secretary/Treasurer for the Broadband Enhancement Council. Motion seconded by Ms. Given. The motion passed unanimously. Chairman Hinton advised that Steve Meester, the Chief Financial Officer for the Department of Commerce, will be performing the majority of the financial responsibilities on behalf of the Council, with the Council officially approving the finances.</p>   |
|  | <p>Discussion on the State purchasing a new Subscription to get the Ookla Data. The cost will be approximately \$29,000, which is much higher than expected as new capabilities have been added. This is a tool used during the mapping to verify the data provided by the providers. It provides speed tests done per month. Chairman Hinton advised that the Ookla data with software will give the Council members access to the site and they will be able to run reports they want themselves. This purchase may need to be bid out if the Council is not exempt or they can't process as a sole source. The council would prefer to use the same vendor so they can compare the data. The Council will address this purchase at the next meeting pending a decision from State Purchasing.</p>   |
| <p><b>Presentation by Tony Simental, GIS Coordinator</b></p>                               | <p>Mr. Simental presented a map that shows commercially available fiber in the state according to the carriers that provided data. It is a high level overview with no specifics for the carriers. The Council would like the providers to provide the detail and data. It was suggested that a set of questions for carriers to answer be developed by the Council. Mr. Simental also showed a new map he is developing with three different tiers of speed. That map is interactive and is being tested. It is not yet available.</p>  |
| <p><b>Presentation by Mark Polen with the WV Cable Telecommunications Association.</b></p> | <p>Mr. Polen advised that five members of the association represent the predominant providers. Approximately \$2.5 billion dollars has been invested for fiber in the State, about \$100 million each year. He advised that 90% of urban areas get 25 Mbps and some much more than that. Only one half of West Virginians have public water and less than one half have public sewer so high speed internet is much better than that.</p> <p>Most providers have applications to provide video services while traveling. Members of the Association are working rapidly on the WiFi service. Shentel purchased Intelos and will provide good rural service. Shentel made a major commitment in McDowell County to deploy fiber, as that is an area that needed service for economic development.</p> <p>The Association surveyed their carriers to provide input to the fiber map presented by Mr. Simental. Carriers have agreements with one another for access to fiber. The Council needs to come up with ideas but it will be up to the providers to implement. If there are resources available they should be channeled to rural areas.</p> |

|   |  |
|---|--|
|   | <p>Discussion on having broadband and access for education. Every student needs it available in their homes. "Internet Essentials" from Comcast is available to people who get free or reduced lunch or live in affordable housing. They also provide computers at reduced rates. Suddenlink has "Connect to Compete" which is a non-profit program. The FCC is looking at a "Lifeline" program for those who qualify financially to get internet service. The Council needs to increase awareness of these programs. Perhaps the Department of Education could facilitate this.</p>   |
| <p><b>Presentation by Jim Martin with CityNet</b></p>     | <p>Mr. Martin provided an overview of CityNet's broadband offerings. He advised that people are cutting out their cable and accessing video on-line. CityNet focuses on the commercial side. A map was provided showing where their data centers are located. CityNet is a full service provider. They have strong partnerships with Cisco, Microsoft and others. They are getting ready to launch Gigabit service to several communities. They have a public website that you can go to and a searchable fiber map to show where they have fiber. He also provided a BTOP fiber map for the last mile showing what was supposed to be built and what was actually built.</p> <p>CityNet is the only company that will allow other providers to purchase dark fiber. There is no affordable open access available to competitors that will allow for competition. You need to identify where lack of fiber exists and get to the street level with data.</p> <p>The challenge is providers can't afford to get to rural areas as it would take two hundred years to see a return on their investment. The cost is \$1.00 to \$2.00 a Mbps outside of WV and in WV it is \$100,000 to \$200,000 a Mbps. If you look at the number of people in a community and assume you will have one half the people use it. The cost to build is \$25,000 per mile but due to the number of miles, you can't afford to get there.</p> |
| <p><b>Presentation by Kevin Wallick with Frontier</b></p> | <p>Mr. Wallick advised that Connect America was to provide the furthest customer with 10 Mbps. The current standard is 25 down/3 up. People choose to select spends under 10 Mbps, even when faster is available, if it works for them they won't spend the extra money for faster speeds. In 2014 93% had 10 Mbps available in WV. Virginia had 98 % but more customers unserved in rural areas than WV. It becomes more expensive to do a build in rural areas and get your investment back. There are 9,500 mile of Frontier fiber in the state.</p> <p>A map was provided that shows how to build a network and where there is fiber currently and where they are building. You need more than one path or the storms would cause outages. The challenge is the last mile. They have forty carriers with which they have agreements for middle mile. It is a large investment to get to homes and you can't get a return on the dollar. Red on the map is where they are and yellow is where they are building out now. Forty to fifty percent of Build America funds should be used for fiber. Their technology is based on distance.</p> <p>Senator Walters requested the cost of 10 Gbps Transportation so he can compare to costs for other states.</p>  |

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <p><b>Chairman's Remarks</b></p>                    | <p>Chairman Hinton passed out a document to the members. He would like to develop a strategic plan as to what they want to work on and accomplish. He requested the members to review the handout and be prepared to brainstorm at the next meeting. Chairman Hinton took the duties that were out lined in the legislation and has recommended actions. The Council needs to develop a Masterplan. All of the regional authorities provided masterplans and they are slightly different due to the type of area and location. The Council needs more information in order to expand on the regional masterplans. He recommended that a consultant be hired to develop a broadband road map to give details on cost efficient solutions. They need a menu of solutions to give options of what they can do and what they can afford. This could be accomplished in a staggered basis by looking at one area and using it as a pilot and then go statewide.</p> <p>Chairman Hinton advised that they need to get a Website for the Council and need to determine if legislative changes are necessary. The Council would like questionnaires be sent to the providers and possibly set up subcommittees. Mr. Martin suggested providers be permitted on the subcommittees as non-voting members.</p> |
| <p><b>Next Meeting Date and Proposed Agenda</b></p> | <p>November 10, 2016</p>  |
| <p><b>Public Comments</b></p>                       | <p>Mr. Martin recommended the Council have a public comment period at the end of each meeting for non-members to make comments.</p>   |
| <p><b>Adjournment</b></p>                           | <p>Meeting was adjourned.</p>   |