

WV Broadband Enhancement Council Meeting Agenda / Minutes



Meeting Title	WV Broadband Enhancement Council Meeting		
Chairperson	Robert Hinton		
Date	November 10, 2016	Location	WV Capitol Complex Building 6, 6 th Floor, Conf. Rm. A
Time	9:00 am		
Audio connection	304.957.6999 Conf. ID: 3750172	Video connection	via Microsoft Outlook Live Meeting

	Council Member	Representing		Council Member	Representing
P	Robert Hinton, Chairman	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 2	P	Josh Jarrell attending for J. Keith Burdette	Dept of Commerce, Cabinet Secretary
P	Robert Morris, Vice Chairman	Urban Residential User	P	Gale Given	Office of Technology, Chief Technology Officer
P	Alissa Novoselick, Secretary/Treasurer	Urban Business User	P	Brenda Morris attending for Michael J. Martirano	Dept. of Education, State Superintendent
P	Robert Cole	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 1	P	Matt Turner	Higher Education Policy Comm., Exec. Vice Chancellor
P	Michael Shaffer	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 2	-	Vacant	WV Senate (Dem. Party) (ex-officio/non-voting member)
P	R.A. "Pete" Hobbs	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 3	-	Vacant	WV Senate (Rep. Party) (ex-officio/non-voting member)
TC	John Reasback	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 1	-	Vacant	WV House (Dem. Party) (ex-officio/non-voting member)
TC	Michael J. Holstine	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 3	-	Vacant	WV House (Rep. Party) (ex-officio/non-voting member)
-	Brittany Carns	Business User of Large Amounts of Broadband	-		
-			-		

P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent

Agenda (Topics and Minutes)

Topic	Details/Minutes
Opening Remarks	-
Minutes from the November 10, 2016 Meeting	The meeting was called to order by Chairman Hinton and it was determined that a quorum was present. Ms. Morris moved for the approval of the October 20, 2016, meeting minutes. Motion seconded by Mr. Cole. The minutes were approved as presented.

<p>Discussion on Ookla Data</p>	<p>Chairman Hinton advised that research had been done on the Ookla Data Subscription. There are other vendors who can do the work but they do not have the ability to go in depth and would provide a much smaller sample size. Ookla is the major vendor who has done 49 out of the 50 mapping projects and utilized this same data set and software. The Council will be able to share reports but not the raw data as it is proprietary. Chairman Hinton believes that the Council has made a case to purchase as a sole source. Mr. Morris moved to authorize \$29,000.00, pending Purchasing Division's approval, for the purchase of the Ookla subscription. Ms. Given amended the motion to authorize up to \$30,000.00 in the event the cost was a little about \$29,000.00. Motion seconded by Mr. Morris. All voted in favor and the Motion carried.</p>
<p>Discussion on Provider Presentations</p>	<p>Hardy Communications has been set up to give a presentation at the December meeting. The Council would like to hear from as many providers as possible. They may want to dig deep with manufacturers of equipment to see what is being utilized and what the capabilities are of the equipment. Wireless coverage and satellite providers need to be included. Stratuswave and MicroLogic have been contacted. The Council would like to try to have MicroLogic present in December. Cambium(?) should be invited to discuss equipment. There should be an educational proponent such as a Professor of Communications or Technology invited to give an unbiased standpoint and to educate the members. Mr. Turner advised that he is aware of a Professor who has a lot of knowledge and expertise in this field who may be willing to speak with us. Ms. Given advised that there are also a lot of conferences out there that discuss broadband issues. The Council can also look at reviewing what other Councils are doing and find out what has worked and what has not worked. There are broadband outreach programs in other states as well. Mr. Cole would like to hear from government representatives such as the FCC who could inform the Council as to what is currently happening. The states of North Carolina and Maine have undergone large projects. They could send representatives. Web conferencing was suggested. Chairman Hinton would like to hold off on having additional providers attend at the December and have educators instead.</p>
<p>Discussion on meetings</p>	<p>It was suggested that the Council meet twice a month going forward. One meeting could be just for webinars and the other one for administrative issues. It was also suggested that they have all the vendors come the same day and make an entire day of it.</p>

<p>Discussion on Strategic Plan</p>	<p>Chairman Hinton provided a draft Strategic Plan in order to spark some ideas and get a rough plan for the Council. The Council needs to determine how to achieve some of the duties placed upon them by the legislation. Higher Education could be a research component as they are connected and can share information between them, the schools and the local libraries. Libraries have the ability but not the money to upgrade their broadband connections. The Libraries are only required to pay 20% but struggle to pay that E-rate amount. Most campuses have access for students but don't share data among schools. Online learning needs expanded and they need to share faculty among institutions and make them a hub for the communities. The problem is that someone has to pay the additional costs to provide access to residents. With schools you can increase student fees but you can't charge the community. The Council wants to look at whether the universities can just provide the space and the providers utilize it. A user fee was suggested for the community but the Council does not want to take fees to the legislature.</p>
<p>Discussion on Website</p>	<p>Council needs to develop a website and put all the information on the site for access by interested individuals. Now that there is a strategic plan the Council needs to include information to disseminate to the public. Chairman Hinton questioned whether all the work is on the shoulders of the Council or could they delegate some of the duties. WVOT or WV Interactive (WVI) could build the website but keeping it up to date and ongoing maintenance wouldn't likely be free. WVOT would be less expensive to create and maintain but couldn't do the work without being paid for the costs. The Council requested that an estimated cost be provided. The Council needs a staff person to fulfill the duties of the Council and maintaining the website design and maintenance. WVI develops websites but the agencies perform all the updates and maintain the site. It would be helpful to have a staff person working between meetings. The Council questioned whether there were any staff of the Department of Commerce who could assist the council. Commerce could explore the cost share issue but not sure they have any who has the capacity as they are stretched thin already. Putting the content on the website is easy it is the development of that content that takes all the time. The staff should have a background in broadband to add value. It was determined that the council needs to focus on the strategic plan first then worry about hiring someone at a later date after the brackets are filled.</p>

<p>Comments by John Reasbeck</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doesn't agree with getting a consultant right from the start. Council needs to determine what resources are available as a state and exhaust those first. • The Council needs to look at the high demand areas first for job creation. Chairman Hinton advised all areas need looked at as a statewide initiative. • Council needs a roadmap and identify legislative changes that are needed. You can't force companies to provide service and the Council doesn't have the money. • BTOP middle mile is too expensive. The Council can't dictate best practices or education. They need to understand education's issues. • Rural health care is an issue and the Council needs to help rural health care providers with telemedicine. • The Council should consider a third-party public relations firm. <p>There was follow up discussion on rural health care and how telehealth would help provide healthcare and benefit residents.</p>
<p>Further discussion on Strategic Plan</p>	<p>Chairman Hinton advised he would take the suggestions from today and polish the strategic plan and bring it back to the December meeting. The Council needs to look at the sections and designate members to take ownership of it in order to move forward. The Ookla data will be beneficial. The Council looked at each header on the plan and assigned Mr. Turner to Higher Education; Mr. Martirano and Ms. Morris to Education; and Mr. Holstine to Health Care.</p>
<p>Discussion on Travel</p>	<p>The Council needs to have an understanding of travel expenses and the long distances some members must travel. It was determined that the travel must be approved by the Council and the members can utilize the Travel Management Guidelines. A Financial Report needs approved at each meeting and the travel expenses could be included in that report that gets approved. Mr. Turner moved to allow the members to approve travel. Motion seconded by Ms. Given. All voted in favor and the motion carried.</p>
<p>Discussion on Public Comments</p>	<p>The Council will develop a sign-in sheet for non-members who wish to make comments at the end of the meeting. Their comments will be limited to three minutes. Mr. Cole requested the members receive all the documents to be provided at the meetings five days in advance.</p>
<p>Public Comments</p>	<p>Phil Halstead advised that he is impressed with what he sees. He ran the Florida version of WVNET for four years and led the partnership Connect for Illinois for broadband mapping. Mr. Halstead lives in Charleston and would be happy to educate the Council on what those two states have done. He could be a resource for the Council</p>
<p>Adjournment</p>	<p>The meeting was adjourned at 10:50 am. Next meeting will be held December 8, 2016.</p>