

WEST VIRGINIA BROADBAND ENHANCEMENT COUNCIL



Approved Meeting Minutes | January 11, 2018

Meeting Title	WV Broadband Enhancement Council Meeting		
Chairperson	Robert Hinton		
Date	1/11/2018	Location	WV Capitol Complex Bldg. 3, Suite 800 Conference Room
Time	10:00 am		
Audio Connection	304.957.6999 Conf. ID: 935-9172#	P = Present; TC = Teleconference; VC = Videoconference; _ = Absent	

	Council Member	Representing		Council Member	Representing
P	Robert Hinton, Chairman	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 2	P	Woody Thrasher	Dept. of Commerce, Cabinet Secretary
P	Robert Morris, Vice Chairman	Urban Residential User	P	Jeff Proctor	Representing Woody Thrasher
P	Michael L. Holstine Secretary-Treasurer	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 3	-	Dr. Steven L. Paine	Dept. of Education, State Superintendent
-	Ric Cavender	Urban Business User	-	Brenda Morris	Representing Dr. Steven L. Paine
TC	Robert Cole	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 1	-	The Honorable Glenn Jeffries	WV Senate (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
TC	John Dunlap	Office of Technology, Chief Technology Officer	-	The Honorable Craig Blair	WV Senate (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
-	R.A. "Pete" Hobbs	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 3	-	The Honorable Roger Hanshaw	WV House (R) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
TC	John Reasbeck	Rural Business User Congressional Dist. 1	-	The Honorable Kenneth Hicks	WV House (D) (Ex-Officio/Advisory Member)
-	Matt Turner	Higher Education Policy Comm., Exec. Vice Chancellor	-	Vacant	Business User Large Amounts of Broadband
TC	Dr. Jack Smith	Representing Matt Turner	-	Vacant	Rural Residential User Congressional Dist. 2
	Representative	Agency		Representative	Agency
P	Mark Debruyn	WVOT Infrastructure Manager, CTO Proxy	P	Tony Simental	WV Geological and Economic Survey, Office of GIS Coordination
P	Mitch Blake	Director, WV Geological and Economic Survey	P	Kelli Talbott	WV Attorney General's Office Legal Counsel
P	Josh Jarrell	WV Dept. of Commerce, Deputy Sec., Legal Counsel	P	Wes White	WV Development Office Legal Counsel
P	Tony O'Leary	WV Development Office Project Manager	P	Kelly Workman	WV Development Office Development Manager

Agenda Item	Details/Minutes
1. Call to Order, Opening Remarks and Roll Call	Roll was taken and the presence of a quorum was confirmed.

<p>2. Approval of 11/ 9/2017 Council Meeting Minutes and Financial Statement</p>	<p>Minutes from the November 9, 2017, Council meeting were presented for approval, along with a current financial statement. Member Holstine moved that the minutes be approved and Member Dunlap provided a second. Motion carried. Member R. Morris moved that the financial report be approved and Member Proctor provided a second. Motion carried.</p>
<p>3. Website-Initial Launch and Ongoing Modifications; Marketing; Prezi; Presentation Kit; Other Marketing and Communications materials/needs.</p> <p>Jordan Ferrell, Commerce Communications</p>	<p>Commerce Communications presented a demo of the Council’s new website, which launched in January. Council members were asked to provide any feedback to Ms. Workman within 10 business days. Other marketing items were discussed, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pop-Up Display for GIS Day at the Legislature and similar events. • Social Media: Twitter and FB accounts created; need to develop communications calendar and social media plan. • How to Prezi: Will be added to website upon completion. • One-Page: Flyer for Meeting Notices; letter to public officials; bill inserts. <p>Mr. DeBruyn expressed concerns regarding his ability to connect communities with providers. Chair Hinton stated that local governments would be responsible for notifying providers negotiating with providers. The Council will help facilitate the process by providing information wherever possible through the website and other methods.</p>
<p>4. Mapping System Project Update; West Virginia Speed Test Launch and Planned Enhancements; Reporting Schedule</p> <p>Tony Simental, State GIS Coordinator</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Speed Test Portal Status Update <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Survey: Working on auto-population. Will add additional questions. • Modifications to Date: Ability to click on certain areas of the map to pinpoint providers by location. Legend now shows wireless or wired providers. The legend may also be enhanced to show providers and types of technology and contact information by region. 2. Statewide Broadband Map Status Update: Mr. Simental demonstrated that all county maps and the statewide map are layered. Chair Hinton noted that this information was critical for the development of grant applications, and would present a cost savings for applicants who would otherwise need to pay for GIS mapping. 3. Statistics to Date: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 26,000 Speed Tests from Council site. • 2,000 online surveys / 1,000 comments • 7,600 below 4 Mbps • 4,000 ranging from 4 to 10 Mbps • 4,000 ranging from 10 to 25 Mbps • 5,000 above 25 mbps 4. Speed test data will soon be available to public with pie-charts, maps, etc. 5. Tests that fail are removed from analytics. 6. Mr. Simental recommended sustained marketing and professional statistical review for qualitative analysis. 7. Testing reveals better service, above 25 mbps along the I-64 Corridor High-Tech Corridor, and the Eastern Panhandle. 8. It was noted that the FCC map is showing Pocahontas County at 10:1 mbps, but speed tests show the area repeatedly under 4 mbps. Member Holstine noted that the 6 mbps is the most popular package because it is the only one available. <p>Chair Hinton stated that the Council will continue to market the speed test and refine data. The Council’s website provides an ideal format for additional data gathering. Speed test data will be layered with FCC data for comparison. Any data tied to wireless will not be included in this analysis. Member Holstine stated that this was the most important thing the Council could do for the citizens of WV because reported Form 477 data is flawed, noting that 10:1 mbps is reported in his area, but is not even offered.</p>

	<p>Member Proctor asked how the Council could identify areas in which service is not available and Mr. Simental suggested a mail-in survey, canvass or community survey as completed in 2014.</p> <p>**It was suggested that language be added to indicate that a mail-in form can be completed upon failure of the speed test.</p> <p>**It was suggested that the Council explore mailers through other state agencies via Commerce Communications.</p> <p>At this time, Secretary Thrasher thanked the Council, noting the overarching goal of getting broadband service to as many West Virginians as possible, as quickly as possible. He urged the Council to forge ahead and shared that Kris Warner, the newly appointed State Director of USDA is interested in working with the Council and should attend a Council meeting in the near term.</p> <p>Mr. Simental noted that pie charts for each county will be developed upon release of the FCC 2016 data in December 2017. Details for each county, town or city will be provided at the March 2018 meeting.</p> <p>Chair Hinton noted that the Council will continue to refine data and add elements of measurement and analysis. The Council will also develop data for New Market Tax Credits. Eligible areas will be mapped to show potential leverage of tax credits and loan guarantees as part of the Council’s push to develop resources.</p>
5. GIS Day at the Legislature	<p>This January 25, 2018 will feature the Council’s mapping initiatives and speed test as the first such outreach event.</p>
6. CBRS (Citizens Broadband Radio Service) Letter to FCC	<p>Priority Access Licenses (PALs) 3550-3700 MHz (3.5z Band)https://www.federalregister.gov/documents/2017/11/28/2017-25672/promoting-investment-in-the-3500-3700-mhz-band.</p> <p>Discussion of the above concerns how wireless technology providers are licensed, whether point to point or last mile. Companies are moving toward radios and working without core networks to reduce operational costs. As the price of licensing increases, this would inhibit small and medium sized providers which may typically serve more rural areas and smaller markets—areas generally not feasible for FTTH or cable. Member R. Morris stated that the Council should submit a letter of concurrence to the sample provided, to the FCC in support of smaller providers, and policies that would encourage service in smaller markets. Member Proctor provided a motion to support Member R. Morris statement. Member Dunlap provided a second. Motion carried.</p>
7. Legal and Technical RFPs	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Legal RFP closing date is January 15, 2018. 2. The final version of the Technical RFP was presented for approval with imminent release by the WV Purchasing Division. Review team must take online training here (Member Hobbs and Mr. Simental need to complete): http://www.state.wv.us/admin/purchase/training/ActivityModule/RFPEvaluation/story_html5.html <p>Member Dunlap asked about the budget. Ms. Workman stated that the WV Purchasing Division suggested a typical rate of \$150 to \$200 per hour for this type of work. Member Proctor moved that the final document be approved as presented and Member Dunlap provided a second. The motion carried.</p>

3. CDBG and ARC Funding	<p>1. CDBG: 12 CDBG Applications Received; Requests Total \$1,587,795. 2. ARC RFP Issued December 8, 2018; Proposals due April 30.</p> <p>Council will assist in development of these projects. The State will guide the procurement of professional services and planning for each of the applicants. All planning should lead to the development of construction projects.</p> <p>Chair Hinton noted that the Council will push for additional CDBG funding for broadband development, and that this first round of funding will be announced roughly 14 months following initial discussion of availability. The response, which included 27 of the state's 55 counties, indicates that the state should balance utilization of this funding between water/sewer and broadband, as the two are complimentary rather than competitive.</p>			
3. Committee Reports	<p>Infrastructure Committee: Member Proctor stated that this committee would meet following the Council meeting. Education Committee: Mr. Smith stated that this committee did not have a meeting scheduled. Adoption Committee: Member Cole stated that this committee would meet following the Council meeting.</p>			
4. Public Comments				
5. Next Meeting Date	March 8, 2018			
6. Adjournment				
Action Items				
No.	Description	Assigned To	Month Identified	Target Completion Date
1.	Easement acquisition and donation	Committee	May	—
2.	Consultation with WV DOH	Council, WVDO, WVOT	May	Ongoing
3.	Website Redesign	Workman, O'Leary, Commerce Communications	May	Initial Launch Complete; Edits Ongoing
4.	Requirements of WV Code 31G	All Committees	June	
5.	Implementation of CDBG projects; Development of ARC projects	Workman, O'Leary	February	Ongoing
6.	Cooperative Toolkit and Training	Workman, O'Leary, Generation WV, WVU Law	June	April

Others Present (in order of sign-in sheet):

1. **Mark Polen, WV Cable Telecom Association**
2. **Jordan Ferrell, Commerce Communications**
3. **Samantha Smith, Commerce Communications**
4. **Ryan Thorn, U.S. Senator Joe Manchin's Office**
5. **Eric Price, Thompson & Litton, LLC**
6. **Marlene Hackett, The Hackett Praxis, LLC**
7. **Jason Pizatella, Spillman Law**
8. **John Tuggle, Region IV PDC**
9. **Chris Morris, CityNet**
10. **Jim Martin, CityNet**
11. **Seth Tuemler, WVDO**

- 12. Jack Smith, WV Higher Education Policy Commission**
- 13. Aaron Spork, U.S. Senator Shelley Moore Capito's Office**
- 14. Ron Pearson**
- 15. Mitch Blake, WV Geological and Economic Survey**

**Meeting Minutes prepared by:
Kelly Workman, WVDO**